

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA
SAN FRANCISCO DIVISION**

COLLEEN JAEGER, et al.,

Plaintiffs,

v.

HOWMEDICA OSTEONICS CORP.,

Defendant.

Case No.: 3:15-cv-164-HSG

Judge: Hon. Haywood S. Gilliam, Jr.

~~**PROPOSED**~~
STIPULATED PROTECTIVE ORDER

1. PURPOSES AND LIMITATIONS

Disclosure and discovery activity in this action are likely to involve production of confidential, proprietary, or private information for which special protection from public disclosure and from use for any purpose other than prosecuting this litigation may be warranted. Accordingly, the parties hereby stipulate to and petition the court to enter the following Stipulated Protective Order. The parties acknowledge that this Order does not confer blanket protections on all disclosures or responses to discovery and that the protection it affords from public disclosure and use extends only to the limited information or items that are entitled to confidential treatment under the applicable legal principles. The parties further acknowledge, as set forth in Section 12.3, below, that this Stipulated Protective Order does not entitle them to file confidential information under seal; Civil Local Rule 79-5 sets forth the procedures that must be followed and the standards that will be applied when a party seeks permission from the court to file material under seal.

2. DEFINITIONS

2.1 Challenging Party: a Party or Non-Party that challenges the designation of information or items under this Order.

2.2 “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items: information (regardless of how it is generated, stored or maintained) or tangible things that qualify for protection under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(c).

2.3 Counsel (without qualifier): Outside Counsel of Record and House Counsel (as well as their support staff).

2.4 Designating Party: a Party or Non-Party that designates information or items that it produces in disclosures or in responses to discovery as “CONFIDENTIAL.”

2.5 Disclosure or Discovery Material: all items or information, regardless of the medium or manner in which it is generated, stored, or maintained (including, among other things, testimony, transcripts, and tangible things), that are produced or generated in disclosures or responses to discovery in this matter.

2.6 Expert: a person with specialized knowledge or experience in a matter pertinent to the litigation who (1) has been retained by a Party or its counsel to serve as an expert witness or as a consultant in this action, (2) is not a past or current employee of a Party or of a Party’s competitor, and (3) at the time of retention, is not anticipated to become an employee of a Party or of a Party’s competitor.

2.7 House Counsel: attorneys who are employees of a party to this action. House Counsel does not include Outside Counsel of Record or any other outside counsel.

2.8 Non-Party: any natural person, partnership, corporation, association, or other legal entity not named as a Party to this action.

2.9 Outside Counsel of Record: attorneys who are not employees of a party to this action but are retained to represent or advise a party to this action and have appeared in this action on behalf of that party or are affiliated with a law firm which has appeared on behalf of that party.

2.10 Party: any party to this action, including all of its officers, directors, employees, consultants, retained experts, and Outside Counsel of Record (and their support staffs).

2.11 Producing Party: a Party or Non-Party that produces Disclosure or Discovery Material in this action.

2.12 Professional Vendors: persons or entities that provide litigation support services (e.g., photocopying, videotaping, translating, preparing exhibits or demonstrations, and

1 organizing, storing, or retrieving data in any form or medium) and their employees and
2 subcontractors.

3 2.13 Protected Material: any Disclosure or Discovery Material that is designated as
4 “CONFIDENTIAL.”

5 2.14 Receiving Party: a Party that receives Disclosure or Discovery Material from a
6 Producing Party.

7 3. **SCOPE**

8 The protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order cover not only Protected Material
9 (as defined above), but also (1) any information copied or extracted from Protected Material; (2)
10 all copies, excerpts, summaries, or compilations of Protected Material; and (3) any testimony,
11 conversations, or presentations by Parties or their Counsel that might reveal Protected Material.
12 However, the protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order do not cover the following
13 information: (a) any information that is in the public domain at the time of disclosure to a
14 Receiving Party or becomes part of the public domain after its disclosure to a Receiving Party as
15 a result of publication not involving a violation of this Order, including becoming part of the
16 public record through trial or otherwise; and (b) any information known to the Receiving Party
17 prior to the disclosure or obtained by the Receiving Party after the disclosure from a source who
18 obtained the information lawfully and under no obligation of confidentiality to the Designating
19 Party. Any use of Protected Material at trial shall be governed by a separate agreement or order.

20 4. **DURATION**

21 Even after final disposition of this litigation, the confidentiality obligations imposed by
22 this Order shall remain in effect until a Designating Party agrees otherwise in writing or a court
23 order otherwise directs. Final disposition shall be deemed to be the later of (1) dismissal of all
24 claims and defenses in this action, with or without prejudice; and (2) final judgment herein after
25 the completion and exhaustion of all appeals, rehearings, remands, trials, or reviews of this action,
26 including the time limits for filing any motions or applications for extension of time pursuant to
27 applicable law.
28

1 **5. DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL**

2 5.1 Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for Protection. Each Party
3 or Non-Party that designates information or items for protection under this Order must take care
4 to limit any such designation to specific material that qualifies under the appropriate standards.
5 The Designating Party must designate for protection only those parts of material, documents,
6 items, or oral or written communications that qualify – so that other portions of the material,
7 documents, items, or communications for which protection is not warranted are not swept
8 unjustifiably within the ambit of this Order.

9 Mass, indiscriminate, or routinized designations are prohibited. Designations that are
10 shown to be clearly unjustified or that have been made for an improper purpose (e.g., to
11 unnecessarily encumber or retard the case development process or to impose unnecessary
12 expenses and burdens on other parties) expose the Designating Party to sanctions.

13 If it comes to a Designating Party's attention that information or items that it designated
14 for protection do not qualify for protection, that Designating Party must promptly notify all other
15 Parties that it is withdrawing the mistaken designation.

16 5.2 Manner and Timing of Designations. Except as otherwise provided in this Order
17 (see, e.g., second paragraph of section 5.2(a) below), or as otherwise stipulated or ordered,
18 Disclosure or Discovery Material that qualifies for protection under this Order must be clearly so
19 designated before the material is disclosed or produced.

20 Designation in conformity with this Order requires:

21 (a) for information in documentary form (e.g., paper or electronic documents, but
22 excluding transcripts of depositions or other pretrial or trial proceedings), that the Producing
23 Party affix the legend "CONFIDENTIAL" to each page that contains protected material. If only a
24 portion or portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also
25 must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the
26 margins).

1 A Party or Non-Party that makes original documents or materials available for inspection
2 need not designate them for protection until after the inspecting Party has indicated which
3 material it would like copied and produced. During the inspection and before the designation, all
4 of the material made available for inspection shall be deemed "CONFIDENTIAL." After the
5 inspecting Party has identified the documents it wants copied and produced, the Producing Party
6 must determine which documents, or portions thereof, qualify for protection under this Order.
7 Then, before producing the specified documents, the Producing Party must affix the
8 "CONFIDENTIAL" legend to each page that contains Protected Material. If only a portion or
9 portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also must clearly
10 identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the margins).

11 (b) for testimony given in deposition or in other pretrial or trial proceedings, that the
12 Designating Party identify on the record, before the close of the deposition, hearing, or other
13 proceeding, all protected testimony and specify the level of protection being asserted. When it is
14 impractical to identify separately each portion of testimony that is entitled to protection and it
15 appears that substantial portions of the testimony may qualify for protection, the Designating
16 Party may invoke on the record (before the deposition, hearing, or other proceeding is concluded)
17 a right to have up to 21 days to identify the specific portions of the testimony as to which
18 protection is sought. Only those portions of the testimony that are appropriately designated for
19 protection within the 21 days shall be covered by the provisions of this Stipulated Protective
20 Order. Alternatively, a Designating Party may specify, at the deposition or up to 21 days
21 afterwards if that period is properly invoked, that the entire transcript shall be treated as
22 "CONFIDENTIAL."

23 Parties shall give the other parties notice if they reasonably expect a deposition, hearing or
24 other proceeding to include Protected Material so that the other parties can ensure that only
25 authorized individuals who have signed the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound"
26 (Exhibit A) are present at those proceedings. The use of a document as an exhibit at a deposition
27 shall not in any way affect its designation as "CONFIDENTIAL."
28

1 Transcripts containing Protected Material shall have an obvious legend on the title page
2 that the transcript contains Protected Material, and the title page shall be followed by a list of all
3 pages (including line numbers as appropriate) that have been designated as Protected Material and
4 the level of protection being asserted by the Designating Party. The Designating Party shall
5 inform the court reporter of these requirements. Any transcript that is prepared before the
6 expiration of a 21-day period for designation shall be treated during that period as if it had been
7 designated "CONFIDENTIAL" in its entirety unless otherwise agreed. After the expiration of that
8 period, the transcript shall be treated only as actually designated.

9 (c) for information produced in some form other than documentary and for any other
10 tangible items, that the Producing Party affix in a prominent place on the exterior of the container
11 or containers in which the information or item is stored the legend "CONFIDENTIAL." If only a
12 portion or portions of the information or item warrant protection, the Producing Party, to the
13 extent practicable, shall identify the protected portion(s).

14 5.3 Inadvertent Failures to Designate. If timely corrected, an inadvertent failure to
15 designate qualified information or items does not, standing alone, waive the Designating Party's
16 right to secure protection under this Order for such material. Upon timely correction of a
17 designation, the Receiving Party must make reasonable efforts to assure that the material is
18 treated in accordance with the provisions of this Order.

19 **6. CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS**

20 6.1 Timing of Challenges. Any Party or Non-Party may challenge a designation of
21 confidentiality at any time. Unless a prompt challenge to a Designating Party's confidentiality
22 designation is necessary to avoid foreseeable, substantial unfairness, unnecessary economic
23 burdens, or a significant disruption or delay of the litigation, a Party does not waive its right to
24 challenge a confidentiality designation by electing not to mount a challenge promptly after the
25 original designation is disclosed.

26 6.2 Meet and Confer. The Challenging Party shall initiate the dispute resolution
27 process by providing written notice of each designation it is challenging and describing the basis
28

1 for each challenge. To avoid ambiguity as to whether a challenge has been made, the written
2 notice must recite that the challenge to confidentiality is being made in accordance with this
3 specific paragraph of the Protective Order. The parties shall attempt to resolve each challenge in
4 good faith and must begin the process by conferring directly (in voice to voice dialogue; other
5 forms of communication are not sufficient) within 14 days of the date of service of notice. In
6 conferring, the Challenging Party must explain the basis for its belief that the confidentiality
7 designation was not proper and must give the Designating Party an opportunity to review the
8 designated material, to reconsider the circumstances, and, if no change in designation is offered,
9 to explain the basis for the chosen designation. A Challenging Party may proceed to the next
10 stage of the challenge process only if it has engaged in this meet and confer process first or
11 establishes that the Designating Party is unwilling to participate in the meet and confer process in
12 a timely manner.

13 6.3 Judicial Intervention. If the Parties cannot resolve a challenge without court
14 intervention, the Designating Party shall file and serve a motion to retain confidentiality under
15 Civil Local Rule 7 (and in compliance with Civil Local Rule 79-5, if applicable) within 21 days
16 of the initial notice of challenge or within 14 days of the parties agreeing that the meet and confer
17 process will not resolve their dispute, whichever is earlier. However, should more than fifteen
18 challenges be made, the burden to move for judicial intervention switches to the Challenging
19 Party, but, the burden of persuasion remains with the Designating Party regardless of which party
20 brings the motion.

21 Each such motion must be accompanied by a competent declaration affirming that the
22 movant has complied with the meet and confer requirements imposed in the preceding paragraph.
23 Failure by the Designating Party to make such a motion including the required declaration within
24 21 days (or 14 days, if applicable) shall automatically waive the confidentiality designation for
25 each challenged designation. In addition, the Challenging Party may file a motion challenging a
26 confidentiality designation at any time if there is good cause for doing so, including a challenge to
27 the designation of a deposition transcript or any portions thereof. Any motion brought pursuant to
28

1 this provision must be accompanied by a competent declaration affirming that the movant has
2 complied with the meet and confer requirements imposed by the preceding paragraph.

3 The burden of persuasion in any such challenge proceeding shall be on the Designating
4 Party. Frivolous challenges, and those made for an improper purpose (e.g., to harass or impose
5 unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) may expose the Challenging Party to
6 sanctions. Unless the Designating Party has waived the confidentiality designation by failing to
7 file a motion to retain confidentiality as described above, all parties shall continue to afford the
8 material in question the level of protection to which it is entitled under the Producing Party's
9 designation until the court rules on the challenge.

10 **7. ACCESS TO AND USE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL**

11 7.1 Basic Principles. A Receiving Party may use Protected Material that is disclosed or
12 produced by another Party or by a Non-Party in connection with this case only for prosecuting,
13 defending, or attempting to settle this litigation. Such Protected Material may be disclosed only to
14 the categories of persons and under the conditions described in this Order. When the litigation has
15 been terminated, a Receiving Party must comply with the provisions of section 13 below (FINAL
16 DISPOSITION).

17 Protected Material must be stored and maintained by a Receiving Party at a location and
18 in a secure manner that ensures that access is limited to the persons authorized under this Order.

19 7.2 Disclosure of "CONFIDENTIAL" Information or Items. Unless otherwise ordered
20 by the court or permitted in writing by the Designating Party, a Receiving Party may disclose any
21 information or item designated "CONFIDENTIAL" only to:

22 (a) the Receiving Party's Outside Counsel of Record in this action, as well as employees
23 of said Outside Counsel of Record to whom it is reasonably necessary to disclose the information
24 for this litigation and who have signed the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" that
25 is attached hereto as Exhibit A;

1 (b) the officers, directors, and employees (including House Counsel) of the Receiving
2 Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have signed the
3 “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

4 (c) Experts (as defined in this Order) of the Receiving Party to whom disclosure is
5 reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have signed the “Acknowledgment and
6 Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

7 (d) the court and its personnel;

8 (e) court reporters and their staff, professional jury or trial consultants, mock jurors, and
9 Professional Vendors to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have
10 signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

11 (f) during their depositions, witnesses in the action to whom disclosure is reasonably
12 necessary and who have signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A),
13 unless otherwise agreed by the Designating Party or ordered by the court. Pages of transcribed
14 deposition testimony or exhibits to depositions that reveal Protected Material must be separately
15 bound by the court reporter and may not be disclosed to anyone except as permitted under this
16 Stipulated Protective Order.

17 (g) the author or recipient of a document containing the information or a custodian or
18 other person who otherwise possessed or knew the information.

19 8. **PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED PRODUCED IN**
20 **OTHER LITIGATION**

21 If a Party is served with a subpoena or a court order issued in other litigation that compels
22 disclosure of any information or items designated in this action as “CONFIDENTIAL,” that Party
23 must:

24 (a) promptly notify in writing the Designating Party. Such notification shall include a
25 copy of the subpoena or court order;

(b) promptly notify in writing the party who caused the subpoena or order to issue in the other litigation that some or all of the material covered by the subpoena or order is subject to this Protective Order. Such notification shall include a copy of this Stipulated Protective Order; and

(c) cooperate with respect to all reasonable procedures sought to be pursued by the Designating Party whose Protected Material may be affected.

If the Designating Party timely seeks a protective order, the Party served with the subpoena or court order shall not produce any information designated in this action as “CONFIDENTIAL” before a determination by the court from which the subpoena or order issued, unless the Party has obtained the Designating Party’s permission. The Designating Party shall bear the burden and expense of seeking protection in that court of its confidential material – and nothing in these provisions should be construed as authorizing or encouraging a Receiving Party in this action to disobey a lawful directive from another court.

9. **A NON-PARTY’S PROTECTED MATERIAL SOUGHT TO BE PRODUCED IN THIS LITIGATION**

(a) The terms of this Order are applicable to information produced by a Non-Party in this action and designated as “CONFIDENTIAL.” Such information produced by Non-Parties in connection with this litigation is protected by the remedies and relief provided by this Order. Nothing in these provisions should be construed as prohibiting a Non-Party from seeking additional protections.

(b) In the event that a Party is required, by a valid discovery request, to produce a Non-Party’s confidential information in its possession, and the Party is subject to an agreement with the Non-Party not to produce the Non-Party’s confidential information, then the Party shall:

(1) promptly notify in writing the Requesting Party and the Non-Party that some or all of the information requested is subject to a confidentiality agreement with a Non-Party;

(2) promptly provide the Non-Party with a copy of the Stipulated Protective Order in this litigation, the relevant discovery request(s), and a reasonably specific description of the information requested; and

(3) make the information requested available for inspection by the Non-Party.

(c) If the Non-Party fails to object or seek a protective order from this court within 14 days of receiving the notice and accompanying information, the Receiving Party may produce the Non-Party's confidential information responsive to the discovery request. If the Non-Party timely seeks a protective order, the Receiving Party shall not produce any information in its possession or control that is subject to the confidentiality agreement with the Non-Party before a determination by the court. Absent a court order to the contrary, the Non-Party shall bear the burden and expense of seeking protection in this court of its Protected Material.

10. **UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL**

If a Receiving Party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has disclosed Protected Material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized under this Stipulated Protective Order, the Receiving Party must immediately (a) notify in writing the Designating Party of the unauthorized disclosures, (b) use its best efforts to retrieve all unauthorized copies of the Protected Material, (c) inform the person or persons to whom unauthorized disclosures were made of all the terms of this Order, and (d) request such person or persons to execute the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" that is attached hereto as Exhibit A.

11. **INADVERTENT PRODUCTION OF PRIVILEGED OR OTHERWISE PROTECTED MATERIAL**

When a Producing Party gives notice to Receiving Parties that certain inadvertently produced material is subject to a claim of privilege or other protection, the obligations of the Receiving Parties are those set forth in Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(b)(5)(B). This provision is not intended to modify whatever procedure may be established in an e-discovery order that provides for production without prior privilege review. Pursuant to Federal Rule of Evidence 502(d) and (e), insofar as the parties reach an agreement on the effect of disclosure of a communication or information covered by the attorney-client privilege or work product protection, the parties may incorporate their agreement in the stipulated protective order submitted to the court.

1 12. **MISCELLANEOUS**

2 12.1 Right to Further Relief. Nothing in this Order abridges the right of any person to
3 seek its modification by the court in the future.

4 12.2 Right to Assert Other Objections. By stipulating to the entry of this Protective
5 Order no Party waives any right it otherwise would have to object to disclosing or producing any
6 information or item on any ground not addressed in this Stipulated Protective Order. Similarly, no
7 Party waives any right to object on any ground to use in evidence of any of the material covered
8 by this Protective Order.

9 12.3 Filing Protected Material. Without written permission from the Designating Party
10 or a court order secured after appropriate notice to all interested persons, a Party may not file in
11 the public record in this action any Protected Material. A Party that seeks to file under seal any
12 Protected Material must comply with Civil Local Rule 79-5. Protected Material may only be filed
13 under seal pursuant to a court order authorizing the sealing of the specific Protected Material at
14 issue. Pursuant to Civil Local Rule 79-5, a sealing order will issue only upon a request
15 establishing that the Protected Material at issue is privileged, protectable as a trade secret, or
16 otherwise entitled to protection under the law. If a Receiving Party's request to file Protected
17 Material under seal pursuant to Civil Local Rule 79-5(d) is denied by the court, then the
18 Receiving Party may file the information in the public record pursuant to Civil Local Rule 79-5(e)
19 unless otherwise instructed by the court.

20 13. **FINAL DISPOSITION**

21 Within 60 days after the final disposition of this action, as defined in paragraph 4, each
22 Receiving Party must return all Protected Material to the Producing Party or destroy such
23 material. As used in this subdivision, "all Protected Material" includes all copies, abstracts,
24 compilations, summaries, and any other format reproducing or capturing any of the Protected
25 Material. Whether the Protected Material is returned or destroyed, the Receiving Party must
26 submit a written certification to the Producing Party (and, if not the same person or entity, to the
27 Designating Party) by the 60 day deadline that (1) identifies (by category, where appropriate) all
28

the Protected Material that was returned or destroyed and (2) affirms that the Receiving Party has not retained any copies, abstracts, compilations, summaries or any other format reproducing or capturing any of the Protected Material. Notwithstanding this provision, Counsel are entitled to retain an archival copy of all pleadings, motion papers, trial, deposition, and hearing transcripts, legal memoranda, correspondence, deposition and trial exhibits, expert reports, attorney work product, and consultant and expert work product, even if such materials contain Protected Material. Any such archival copies that contain or constitute Protected Material remain subject to this Protective Order as set forth in Section 4 (DURATION).

IT IS SO STIPULATED, THROUGH COUNSEL OF RECORD.

/s/ James G. O'Brien

James G. O'Brien (0088460) (PHV)
ZOLL, KRANZ & BORGESS, LLC
6620 W. Central Ave., Suite 100
Toledo, OH 43617
Tel. (419) 841-9623
Fax (419) 841-9719
Email jim@zkblaw.com

Lori E. Andrus (SBN 205816)
ANDRUS ANDERSON LLP
155 Montgomery Street, Suite 900
San Francisco, CA 94104
Telephone: (415) 986-1400
Facsimile: (415) 986-1474
lori@andrusanderson.com

Counsel for Plaintiffs Colleen Jaeger and William Jaeger

/s/ Paul E. Asfendis (by permission)

Paul E. Asfendis
GIBBONS PC
One Pennsylvania Plaza
37th Floor
New York, NY 10119
212-613-2067
Email: pasfendis@gibbonslaw.com

Mario Horwitz
SEDGWICK LLP
801 South Figueroa Street, 19th Floor

Los Angeles, CA 90017-5556
213-426-6900
Fax: 213-426-6921
Email: mario.horwitz@sdma.com

James Nelson
SEDGWICK LLP
801 S Figueroa St
18th Flr
Los Angeles, CA 90017-2816
(213) 426-6900
Fax: (213)426-6921
Email: james.nelson@sedgwicklaw.com

Kim M. Catullo
GIBBONS PC
One Pennsylvania Plaza
37th Floor
New York, NY 10119
212-613-2001
Email: kcatullo@gibbonslaw.com

Counsel for Defendant Howmedica Osteonics Corp.

ATTESTATION OF SIGNATURE

Pursuant to Northern District of California Local Rule 5-1(i), I attest I obtained the other signatory's concurrence in the filing of this document.

/s/ James G. O'Brien

PURSUANT TO STIPULATION, IT IS SO ORDERED

DATED: 8/5/2015



United States District Judge

EXHIBIT A**ACKNOWLEDGMENT AND AGREEMENT TO BE BOUND**

I, _____ [print or type full name], of _____
 [print or type full address], declare under penalty of perjury that I have read in its entirety and
 understand the Stipulated Protective Order that was issued by the United States District Court for
 the Northern District of California on _____ in the case of *Colleen Jaeger et al. v.*
Howmedica Osteonics Corp., No. 3:15-cv-164-HSG. I agree to comply with and to be bound by
 all the terms of this Stipulated Protective Order and I understand and acknowledge that failure to
 so comply could expose me to sanctions and punishment in the nature of contempt. I solemnly
 promise that I will not disclose in any manner any information or item that is subject to this
 Stipulated Protective Order to any person or entity except in strict compliance with the provisions
 of this Order.

I further agree to submit to the jurisdiction of the United States District Court for the
 Northern District of California for the purpose of enforcing the terms of this Stipulated Protective
 Order, even if such enforcement proceedings occur after termination of this action.

I hereby appoint _____ [print or type full name] of
 _____ [print or type full address and telephone
 number] as my California agent for service of process in connection with this action or any
 proceedings related to enforcement of this Stipulated Protective Order.

Date: _____

City and State where sworn and signed: _____

Printed name: _____

Signature: _____